IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS SAN ANTONIO DIVISION

MICHAEL ESPINOSA,	§	
Plaintiff,	§	
	§	
V.	§	CIVIL ACTION NO. 5:15-CV-879-XR
	§	
	§	
STEVENS TANKER DIVISION, LLC,	§	
Defendant.	§	

PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSED MOTION TO QUASH, FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER AND OBJECTIONS TO DEFENDANT'S NOTICE FOR ORAL DEPOSITIONS OF MICHELLE McDOUGAL, KRYSTYNN McCAFFREY, CARLY POWELL AND MARK MURRAY

Now comes Plaintiffs in the above-styled and numbered cause and files this his Motion to Quash, For Protective Order and Objections to Defendant's Notice of Intention to take the Oral Deposition of Plaintiffs Michelle McDougal, Krystynn McCaffrey, Carly Powell and Mark Murray noticed for Friday, April 28, 2017, in the above matter, and for cause would respectfully show unto the Court the following:

OVERVIEW

Defendant did not confer on agreeable date or time; scheduled the depositions on a date that conflicts with previously scheduled depositions; the deponents include one who will be opting out, Plaintiff is unable to schedule the depositions on such short notice and Plaintiff's Motion for Decertification is pending.

DECERTIFICATION MUTES DEPOSTIONS OF OPT-INS IN PLAINTIFF ESPINOSA'S LAWSUIT

Plaintiff's Motion to Decertify Conditional Class was filed on March 21, 2017. Plaintiff filed the Decertification Motion because discovery had shown that Plaintiff and opt-in plaintiffs are not similar for class purposes and opt-in plaintiffs worked under different conditions that Plaintiff Espinosa. (DE 91).

DEFENDANT DID NOT CONFER WITH PLAINTIFF'S COUNSEL PRIOR TO SCHEDULING THESE DEPOSITIONS

Defendant was aware on March 29, 2017, that the Court was not extending the discovery deadline past Mary 1, 2017. (The Court's text order denying Plaintiff's request to extend discovery deadline past May 1, 2017).

April 5, 2017: Plaintiff gave Defendant notice that the depositions of Ayala and Moore would take place in Plaintiff's Counsel on April 28, 2017. (Ex.1)

April 20, 2017, Defendant sent the Notice of Intention to Take the Oral Depositions of four opt-in plaintiffs without consulting with Plaintiff's counsel as to scheduling or availability on April 28, 2017.

DEFENDANT'S NOTICES FOR APRIL 28, 2017, CONFLICT WITH PREVIOUSLY SCHEDULED DEPOSITIONS SUBPOENAED FOR APRIL 28, 2017.

APRIL 8 AND 10, 2017: PLAINITFF SUBPOENAED TWO FORMER EMPLOYEES

TO BE DEPOSED ON APRIL 28, 2017

Plaintiff Espinosa had two dispatch supervisors: Hilton Ayala and Barbara Moore. Plaintiff had requested whether Defendant would make these witnesses available; Defendant did not; and Plaintiff was required to issue subpoenas.

March 29, 2017: The Court's text order denyied Plaintiff's request to extend discovery deadline past May 1, 2017.

April 5, 2017: Plaintiff issued Defendant notice that the depositions of Ayala and Moore would take place in Plaintiff's Counsel on April 28, 2017. (Ex,1)

April 8, 2017: Plaintiff subpoenaed Barbara Moore ordering Moore to appear for deposing in Plaintiff's counsel's office on April 28, 2017, beginning at 1:00 p.m..(Ex. 3)

April 10, 2017: Plaintiff subpoenaed Hilton Ayala ordering Ayala to appear for deposing in Plaintiff's counsel's office on April 28, 2017, beginning at 10:00 a.m. (Ex. 2)

MICHELLE McDOUGAL

Counsel is waiting on an opt-out form from Ms.McDougal. Additionally,

LENGTH OF DEPOSITIONS

Defendant has noticed 4 depositions to be taken on 1 day. This is not reasonable.

Defendant has previous depositions:

- a. Plaintiff Espinosa lasted from 10:28 am to 5:22 p.m. (Ex. 4)
- b. Louis Willis lasted from 10:23 a..m. to 4:09 p.m. (Ex. 5)

Based on the above, Plaintiffs hereby file their Motion to Quash and request for protective order and objections thereto.

2. PRAYER

WHEREFORE, PREMISES CONSIDERED, Plaintiffs pray that the Court grant Plaintiffs Motion to Quash, For Protective Order and/or sustain their objections. Plaintiffs further pray for all other relief as Plaintiffs may show themselves justly entitled.

Respectfully Submitted,

BY: /s/ Adam Poncio
ADAM PONCIO
State Bar No. 16109800

PONCIO LAW OFFICES A Professional Corporation 5410 Fredericksburg Road, Suite 109 San Antonio, Texas 78229-3550 Telephone: (210) 212-7979 Facsimile: (210) 212-5880

ATTORNEYS FOR PLAINTIFFS

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on the 24th day of April, 2017, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using CM/ECF system and served on the following interested parties:

Stephen C. Key John L. Freeman 3710 Rawlins Street, Suite 950 Dallas, Tx 75219 (214) 615-7929 (Key Telephone) (214) 615-7923 (Freeman Telephone) (214) 615-7926 Facsimile

/s/ Adam Poncio

ADAM PONCIO

Angela Maldonado

From:

Angela Maldonado <amaldonado@ponciolaw.com>

Sent:

Wednesday, April 05, 2017 1:54 PM

To:

skey@keyharrington.com; jfreeman@keyharrington.com

Cc:

'Chris McJunkin'; 'Adam Poncio'; 'Misty Eubanks'

Subject:

RE: Activity in Case 5:15-cv-00879-XR Michael Espinosa v. Stevens Tanker Division. LLC

Order on Motion for Miscellaneous Relief

All,

Please not that that deposition notices for Ayala and Moore will be set for April 28, 2017 in our offices.

Sincerely,

Angela Maldonado

Poncio Law Offices A Professional Corporation 5410 Fredericksburg Rd., Suite 109 San Antonio, TX 78229 (210) 212-7979 Telephone (210) 212-5880 Facsimile

From: Adam Poncio [mailto:SALAW@msn.com]
Sent: Wednesday, April 05, 2017 8:02 AM

To: skey@keyharrington.com; jfreeman@keyharrington.com

Cc: Chris McJunkin <cmcjunkin@stx.rr.com>; Angela Maldonado <amaldonado@ponciolaw.com>; Misty Eubanks

<meubanks@keyharrington.com>

Subject: Fw: Activity in Case 5:15-cv-00879-XR Michael Espinosa v. Stevens Tanker Division. LLC Order on Motion for

Miscellaneous Relief

As provided in the Court's 3/29/17 order set out below, I am attaching the 30(b)(6) depo notice and set for 5/1/17 and the notice for William Hayes set for 3/27. I will be re-noticing Ayala and Moore for 3/28 at our offices.

Adam Poncio Board Certified-Labor and Employment Law Board Certified-Civil Appellate Law Texas Board of Legal Specialization

PONCIO LAW OFFICES A Professional Corporation 5410 Fredericksburg Rd., Suite 109 San Antonio, Texas 78229-3550 (210) 212-7979 Telephone

(210) 212-5880 Facsimile

From: TXW USDC Notice@txwd.uscourts.gov < TXW USDC Notice@txwd.uscourts.gov >

Sent: Wednesday, March 29, 2017 3:35 PM **To:** cmecf notices@txwd.uscourts.gov

Subject: Activity in Case 5:15-cv-00879-XR Michael Espinosa v. Stevens Tanker Division. LLC Order on Motion for

Miscellaneous Relief

This is an automatic e-mail message generated by the CM/ECF system. Please DO NOT RESPOND to this e-mail because the mail box is unattended.

NOTE TO PUBLIC ACCESS USERS Judicial Conference of the United States policy permits attorneys of record and parties in a case (including pro se litigants) to receive one free electronic copy of all documents filed electronically, if receipt is required by law or directed by the filer. PACER access fees apply to all other users. To avoid later charges, download a copy of each document during this first viewing. However, if the referenced document is a transcript, the free copy and 30 page limit do not apply.

U.S. District Court [LIVE]
Western District of Texas

Notice of Electronic Filing

The following transaction was entered on 3/29/2017 at 3:35 PM CDT and filed on 3/29/2017

Case Name:

Michael Espinosa v. Stevens Tanker Division. LLC

Case Number:

5:15-cv-00879-XR

Filer:

Document Number: No document attached

Docket Text:

Text Order GRANTING IN PART [90] Motion to Set Deadline and Compel entered by Judge Xavier Rodriguez. As to Plaintiffs request for production, Defendant is to produce all responsive documents relating to the remaining opt-in plaintiffs by April 4, 2017. As to Plaintiffs request that Defendant provide deposition dates for the witnesses identified at the February 27 hearing, Plaintiffs are authorized to notice depositions of these witnesses on a date convenient for Plaintiffs counsel if Defendant does not provide dates by April 4, 2017. Plaintiffs request for an extension of the discovery period is DENIED. (This is a text-only entry generated by the court. There is no document associated with this entry.) (pp)

5:15-cv-00879-XR Notice has been electronically mailed to:

Adam Poncio salaw@msn.com, amaldonado@ponciolaw.com, vsturgis@ponciolaw.com

Christopher Edwin McJunkin cmcjunkin@stx.rr.com

John L. Freeman jfreeman@keyharrington.com, meubanks@keyharrington.com

Stephen C. Key <u>skey@keyharrington.com</u>, <u>kporter@keyharrington.com</u>, <u>meubanks@keyharrington.com</u>

5:15-cv-00879-XR Notice has been delivered by other means to:

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

Western District of Texas

AA G21G111	District of Texas
MICHAEL ESPINOSA, Plaintiff v. STEVENS TANKER DIVISION, LLC, Defendant)) Civil Action No. 5:15-CV-00879-XR))
SUBPOENA TO TESTIFY AT	A DEPOSITION IN A CIVIL ACTION
Tot	HILTON AYALA
	to whom this subpoena is directed)
deposition to be taken in this civil action. If you are an	pear at the time, date, and place set forth below to testify at a organization, you must designate one or more officers, directors, sent to testify on your behalf about the following matters, or
Place: 5410 Fredricksburg Rd., Suite 109	Date and Time:
San Antonio, Texas 78229	04/28/2017 10:00 am
The deposition will be recorded by this method:	Court reporter and possibly videographer
 Production: You, or your representatives, must electronically stored information, or objects, and material: 	also bring with you to the deposition the following documents, I must permit inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of the
The following provisions of Fed. R. Civ. P. 45 at Rule 45(d), relating to your protection as a person subject respond to this subpoena and the potential consequences	re attached — Rule 45(c), relating to the place of compliance; it to a subpoena; and Rule 45(e) and (g), relating to your duty to of not doing so.
Date:04/05/2017 CLERK OF COURT	OR ALL
Signature of Clerk or Deputy	Clerk Attorney's signature
The name, address, e-mail address, and telephone number Michael Espinosa	
dam Poncio, 5410 Fredricksburg Rd., Suite 109, San Ant	, who issues or requests this subpoena, are:
	onio, Texas 78229 (210) 212-7979 salaw@msn.com

Notice to the person who issues or requests this subpoena

If this subpoena commands the production of documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things, a notice and a copy of the subpoena must be served on each party in this case before it is served on the person to whom it is directed. Fed. R. Civ. P. 45(a)(4).

Civil Action No. 5:15-CV-00879-XR

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 45.)

	I received th	is subpoena for (name of individual and title, if any) Hiton Ayala.					
on (de	$\frac{4\cdot 5\cdot l\cdot f}{1}$						
	I served the subpoena by delivering a copy to the named individual as follows: Hilton Ayala						
	-	<u> </u>					
		on (date) 4-10-17; or					
	☐ I returned	the subpoena unexecuted because:					
	-						
	Unless the su tendered to th	bpoena was issued on behalf of the United States, or one of its officers or agents, I have also be witness the fees for one day's attendance, and the mileage allowed by law, in the amount of					
	•						
My fe	es are \$	for travel and \$ for services, for a total of \$0.00					
	I declare unde	er penalty of perjury that this information is true.					
Date:	4-10+17	wc_					
		Server's signature					
		MACIOV. CordovA SCH 2353 Exp 12.31-18 Printed name and title					
		Printed name and title					
		3658 Candlehead Lr. San Antonio TX 78244 Server's address					

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc.:

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

for the

Western District of Texas

unct of Texas				
) Civil Action No. 5:15-CV-00879-XR))				
DEPOSITION IN A CIVIL ACTION				
BARBARA MOORE				
hom this subpoena is directed)				
at the time, date, and place set forth below to testify at a mization, you must designate one or more officers, directors to testify on your behalf about the following matters, or				
Date and Time:				
04/28/2017 1:00 pm				
ourt reporter and possibly videographer				
bring with you to the deposition the following documents, st permit inspection, copying, testing, or sampling of the				
tached — Rule 45(c), relating to the place of compliance; a subpoena; and Rule 45(e) and (g), relating to your duty to ot doing so.				
OR ALL				
Attorney's signature				
the attorney representing (name of party), who issues or requests this subpoena, are:				
, Texas 78229 (210) 212-7979 salaw@msn.com				

Notice to the person who issues or requests this subpoena

If this subpoena commands the production of documents, electronically stored information, or tangible things, a notice and a copy of the subpoena must be served on each party in this case before it is served on the person to whom it is directed. Fed. R. Civ. P. 45(a)(4).

Civil Action No. 5:15-CV-00879-XR

PROOF OF SERVICE

(This section should not be filed with the court unless required by Fed. R. Civ. P. 45.)

	I received this subpoena for	(name of individual and title, if any)	Barbara MOORE	2
on (da	If $\frac{4-5\cdot1\cdot1}{1}$. If served the subpoena by	delivering a copy to the named	individual as follows:	ala Mac
			on (date) 4-8-17; or	
	☐ I returned the subpoena u	nexecuted because:		
	Unless the subpoena was iss tendered to the witness the fe	ued on behalf of the United Sta ees for one day's attendance, an	tes, or one of its officers or agents, I	have also e amount of
My fee	es are \$	for travel and \$	for services, for a total of \$	0.00 .
	I declare under penalty of pen	jury that this information is tru	e.	
Date:	4-8-17	· L	Server's signature	
		MACIO V. Core	Printed name and title	23148
		3458 Candle	hoad La. SAN Antonio Server's address	TX 78244

Additional information regarding attempted service, etc.:

Michael Espinosa vs. Stevens Tanker Division LLC

Deposition of	Michael Espinosa			Michael	Espinosa vs. Stevens Tank	er Division, LLC
	Pag	1				Page 3
	IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS] 1	L	INDEX	
	SAN ANTONIO DIVISION		2	2	PAGE	
	3 MICHAEL ESPINOSA §		3	APPEAR	ANCES	2
	4 Plaintiff, \$	-	4	THE WIT	NESS: MICHAEL ESPINOS	A
	5 V. SCivil Action No. 5:15-cv-879		5	Examinati	on by Mr. Stephen Key	5
	STEVENS TANKER DIVISION, LLC,§	and the second	6		and Changes	182
ŀ	7 Defendant, 8		7	Reporter's	Certificate	184
	ORAL DEPOSITION OF		8	Further Ce	rtification	186
	MICHAEL ESPINOSA		9		EXHIBITS	į
10	,	The state of the s	10	NO.	DESCRIPTION	PAGE MARKED
11			11	Exhibit 1	Plaintiff Original Complaint	24
12	Para la constanta de la consta		12	Exhibit 2	Initial Disclosures	30
13	Est mosh, produced	as	13	Exhibit 3	Letter for Sabrina Watts	43
14	Talmer Biriskin,		14	Exhibit 4	July 21, 2014 e-mail	46
15	, taringini, zanies, and		15	Exhibit 5	Pictures	48
16	Tyled and nambered		16	Exhibit 6	May 14, 2014 e-mail	67
17	Commence of the Commence of th		17	Exhibit 7	May 16, 2014 e-mail	71
18	Particular and the Control of the Co		18	Exhibit 8	July 23, 2014 e-mail	81
19	of Texas, reported by machine shorthand, at the Poncio Law		19	Exhibit 9	April 29, 2014 e-mail	86
20	Offices, 5410 Fredericksburg Road, Suite 109, San Antonio,		20	Exhibit 10	July 22, 2014 e-mail	95
21	Texas 78229, pursuant to the Federal Rules of Civil and		21	Exhibit 11	August 23, 2014 e-mail	100
22	the provisions stated on the record or attached hereto.		22	Exhibit 12	August 24, 2014 e-mail	104
23			23	Exhibit 13	May 1, 2014 e-mail	108
24			24	Exhibit 14	September 17, 2014 e-mail	114
25			25	Exhibit 15	June 25, 2014 e-mail	117
,	Page	2				Page 4
1 2	A P P E A R A N C E S		1	Exhibit 16	April 30, 2014 e-mail	119
	FOR MICHAEL ESPINOSA:		2	Exhibit 17	June 25, 2014 e-mail	122
3	MD STEDUENC VEV		3	Exhibit 18	September 15, 2014 e-ma	nil 123
4	MR. STEPHEN C. KEY KEY HARRINGTON BARNES, P.C.		4	Exhibit 19	October 15/16, 2014 e-m	
5	3710 Rawlins Street, Suite 950 Dallas, Texas 75219 Telephone (AUC) 15, 7000		5	Exhibit 20	August 21, 2014 e-mail	129
6	Telephone: (214) 615-7929 Fax: (214) 615-7926 Emply share 2015	1	6	Exhibit 21	August 22, 2014 e-mail	131
7	Email: skey@keyharrington.com		7	Exhibit 22	May 27, 2014 e-mail	131
8	EOD STEVENS TANKED BUUSION AL T		8	Exhibit 23	August 23, 2014 e-mail	133
9	FOR STEVENS TANKER DIVISION, LLC:		9	Exhibit 24	August 24, 2014 e-mail	139
10	MR. ADAM PONCIO MR. THOMAS N. CAMMACK, III PONCIO LAW OFFICES		10	Exhibit 25	August 21, 2014 e-mail	140
11	5410 Fredericksburg Road, Suite 109		11	Exhibit 26	October 3, 2014 e-mail	144
12	San Antonio, Texas 78229-3550 Telephone: (210) 212-7979 Fax: (210) 212-5880		12	Exhibit 27	July 23, 2014 e-mail	153
13 14	Email: salaw@msn.com		13	Exhibit 28	October 13, 2014 e-mail	154
			14	Exhibit 29	Document	157
15			15			ľ
16			16			
17			17			
18			18			
19			19			
20	ALSO PRESENT:		20			
			21			
I .	MR. BRUCE DEAN, OBSERVER FOR STEVENS TANKER DIVISION		22			
t	MS. SARAH MURPHY, TEXAS CERTIFIED SHORTHAND REPORTER	:	23		*	.4
24		ĺ	24			X /
25			25			
Hoffman Repor	ting & Video Service					

Deposition of	Louis Willis			Michael Espinosa vs. Stevens Tanker Division, LLC
	Pag	e 1		Page 3
]	FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS		1	· ·
2	1		2	FOR PLAINTIFF LOUIS WILLIS:
3)		3	
4) Civil Action		4	CHRISTOPHER MCJUNKIN LAW OFFICE OF CHRISTOPHER MCJUNKIN
5	1,		5	1 ZOTZ LAWIIVIEW
6	7, 5, 7, 5, 6, 7, 5, 5, 7,		6	FHONE: (361) 882-5747 FAX: (361) 882-8926
7	/		7	E-MAIL: cmcjunkin@stx.rr.com
8	*************	**	8	THE PERSON NAMED IN THE PERSON LINE IN
9	THE ORAL DEPOSITION OF		9	STEPHEN C. KEY
10			10	KEY HARRINGTON BARNES, PC 3710 Rawlins Street, Suite 950
11	FEBRUARY 20, 2017		11	STEPHEN C. KEY KEY HARRINGTON BARNES, PC 3710 Rawlins Street, Suite 950 Dallas, Texas 75219 PHONE: (214) 615-7929 FAX: (214) 615-7926 E-MAIL: skey@keyharrington.com
12	*************	**	12	FAX: (214) 615-7926 E-MAIL: skey@keyharrington.com
13	THE ORAL DEPOSITION of LOUIS WILLIS,		13	
14	produced as a witness at the instance of the		14	
15	Defendant, and duly sworn, was taken in the		15	
16	above-styled and numbered cause on the 20th day of		16	ALSO PRESENT:
17	February, 2017, from 10:28 a.m. to 5:22 p.m., before		17	LOUIS WILLIS, The Witness; and
18	TERRY L. LOCHTE, Certified Court Reporter in and for		18	
19	the State of Texas, reported by stenographic and		19	TERRY L. LOCHTE, Certified Court Reporter.
20	computer-aided transcription, at the PONCIO LAW		20	
21	OFFICES, 5410 Fredericksburg Road, Suite 109,		21	
22	San Antonio, Texas 78229-3550, pursuant to the		22	
23	Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, and the provisions		23	[
24	stated on the record attached hereto.		24	
25			25	
	Page	2		Page 4
1	S-T-I-P-U-L-A-T-I-O-N-S		1	I-N-D-E-X
2			2	THE WITNESS:
3	It is stipulated and agreed by and		3	LOUIS WILLIS PAGE
	between counsel for the respective parties hereto		4	11102
	that the original transcript of the deposition of		5	Stipulations 2
	LOUIS WILLIS shall be sent to ADAM PONCIO, attorn	еу		Appearances 3
	for the plaintiff, for the purpose of obtaining the		7	Index 4
	signature of the witness thereon before any notary		8	Exhibit Index4-6
1 1	public.			Examination by Mr. Key 7
10	-oOo-		10	Examination by Mr. McJunkin
11			11]	Examination by Mr. Key 217
12			12	Examination by Mr. McJunkin 227
14			13	Examination by Mr. Key 228
15			14	Witness Signature Page 233
16			15	Reporter's Jurat234
17			16	
18			17	E-X-H-I-B-I-T I-N-D-E-X
19			18	EXHIBIT NO. PAGE
20			19	PAGE
21			20]	Exhibit 1 E-Mail Correspondence, 8
22			211	ľ
23				Exhibit 2 F-Mail Correspondence, 25
24			23 I	Exhibit 3 F-Mail Correspondence, 59 TD-E 002782-002783
25			67	Exhibit 4 E-Mail Correspondence, 64
	ting & Video Service		25	TD-E 002824 100 portactice, 04
OLIHIGH INCUUN	une of Airco service			

Hoffman Reporting & Video Service

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS SAN ANTONIO DIVISION

MICHAEL ESPINOSA,	§	
Plaintiff,	§	
	§	
v.	§	CIVIL ACTION NO. 5:15-CV-879-XR
	§	
	§	
STEVENS TANKER DIVISION, LLC,	§	
Defendant.	§	

ORDER ON PLAINTIFFS' OPPOSED MOTION TO QUASH, FOR PROTECTIVE ORDER AND OBJECTIONS TO DEFENDANT'S NOTICE FOR ORAL DEPOSITIONS OF MICHELLE McDOUGAL, KRYSTYNN McCAFFREY, CARLY POWELL AND MARK MURRAY

The matter before the Court is Plaintiffs' Motion to Quash, For Protective Order and Objections to Defendant's Notice of Intention to take the Oral Deposition of Opt-In Plaintiffs Michelle McDougal, Krystynn McCaffrey, Carly Powell and Mark Murray. Having considered the motion and the status of this case, the Court is of the opinion that the motion should be GRANTED.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that Plaintiffs' Motion to Quash, For Protective Order and Objections to Defendant's Notice of Intention to take the Oral Deposition of Michelle McDougal, Krystynn McCaffrey, Carly Powell and Mark Murray is hereby GRANTED.

Signed this	day of April, 2017
XAVIER RODRIG	IFZ
Honorable United S	
Tionorable Office 3	iales District Judge